Commission on Women and Gender Equity in Academia

Literature and Resources for further investigation

The Commission offers this list of key readings and resources we have identified as most useful in our research. If you are interested in further information in any area, or have others to recommend to us or other members of the community, please contact the commission.

CAMPUS CLIMATE OR CAMPUS CULTURE

ASSESSING AND DIAGNOSING CLIMATE/CULTURE


This meta-analysis reviewed 118 campus climate studies focusing on women, race/ethnicity, sexual orientation, disability, religion, age, and SES, and gives helpful ways of thinking about instruments to measure campus climate progress as well as set of recommendations.


This highly-cited article reviews different instruments for measuring campus climate, and also talks about the different aspects of campus climate, including psychological and behavioral components.

REVIEW OF BARRIERS TO DIVERSITY


This article is useful starting place for understanding the historical and ongoing elements that systematically disadvantage women in academia.


This article is useful starting place for understanding the historical and ongoing elements that systematically disadvantage underrepresented minority faculty in academia.

GENERAL BEST PRACTICE CONSIDERATIONS IN FOSTERING A DIVERSE CAMPUS

This article provides an extensive review of the literature and of best practices in developing and maintaining diversity.


This doctoral dissertation focused on interviewing chief diversity officers, and delineated the personal and institutional factors that make for a really effective CDO. This resource can contribute to ongoing discussions of how such work should be coordinated across campus, as well as who should be recruited to do the work.


This article is written from a non-academic (business) point of view—but it details REALLY clearly how buy-in must be systematic and widespread for diversity initiatives to work.


This article focuses on diversity in women, and evaluates policies to increase gender diversity. It is especially notable for its point that the intensity of the effort—measured in number of initiatives, and how well those initiatives addressed key concerns—was proportional to the success of diversity initiatives.

SEARCH & RECRUITMENT

USEFUL GUIDELINES FOR RECRUITING A DIVERSE FACULTY


All three books above contain practical step-by-step strategies that departments can use for promoting a hiring practice likely to identify diverse candidates. These recommendations are backed by scholarly outcomes-based literature, and also are echoed in the public-facing guidelines from some of our comparable institutions.

USEFUL GUIDELINES FOR RECRUITING AND RETAINING A DIVERSE PIPELINE → FACULTY

*This article provides an excellent and very accessible review of the literature around the factors that steadily influence women to drop out of the pipeline at each stage, and also provides some suggestions about addressing the issues.*


*Articles about recruiting and retaining a pipeline with full inclusion of underrepresented minorities tend to be treated in discipline-specific ways, rather than in full reviews, as in the case of the Gasser & Shaffer paper. The three listed above are useful examples (one from STEM; two from the social sciences) that review the considerations and make similar recommendations.*


*This article clearly explains the intersectional nature of many considerations, by highlighting the situation of underrepresented minority women.*

The National Postdoctoral Association offers some guidance for particular faculty or departments who are interested in creating a diverse applicant pool, fostering a welcoming culture, and mentoring: [http://www.nationalpostdoc.org/?Diversity](http://www.nationalpostdoc.org/?Diversity), as well as a list of suggested funding sources meant to support diversity efforts. This organization, in combination with Elsevier, has sponsored a clearinghouse with resources for women postdoctoral fellows, including resources for mentoring, links to organizations like the Association of Women in Science, professional development resources, and links to childcare support. [http://www.nationalpostdoc.org/mpage/elsevier](http://www.nationalpostdoc.org/mpage/elsevier).

*These are online clearinghouse lists of resources.*

**ONBOARDING AND ORIENTATION**

Ellaway, R. H., Cooper, G., Al-Idrissi, T., Dubé, T., & Graves, L. (2014). Discourses of student orientation to medical education programs. *Medical Education Online, 19*(1), 23714.

*This article provides a really excellent overview of the multiple factors that need to be considered during a thorough orientation. Orientation is not simply a “one and done” about practical matters, but needs to consider social, cultural, and practical factors.*

A review of onboarding practices at 148 medical schools suggests several best practices, including spreading orientation out over time and fostering mentoring and relationships, as well as highlighting the need for ongoing assessment of the orientations.


This article explores how pre-tenure faculty members develop networks that will help them to succeed, and suggests that universities must formally foster these networks for maximum benefit.


The two articles above consider how trainees being socialized into a discipline require even more extensive and long-term orientations than those who are already accepted members of the community, and how being a member of an underrepresented group (either based on gender or race/ethnicity) can add an extra layer of complexity.

**COMPENSATION AND NEGOTIATION: GENDER AND MINORITY EQUITY IN PAY**


This paper examines several underlying explanations for the observed gender gap in pay for equal positions.


The authors mined data from the National Study of Postsecondary Faculty (stratified by years, and limited to “recently hired”) and identified gaps in pay equity for both women and members of underrepresented minority groups.


This paper notes that having female representation at the full professor rank is associated with improved gender equity in pay.

**RETENTION**

Commission on Women and Gender Equity in Academia Preliminary Report, Appendix C

This interview-based study describes the reasons that early-career faculty (including men, women, and individuals from minority and majority populations) who have actually decided to leave give for their departure. Three themes emerge: unmet expectations around professional relationships, a mismatch between the faculty member and institution around the nature of the work and the criteria for advancement, and resources. A mismatch between stated desires to foster minority representation and the resources available for this mission was noted.


This article investigates publication patterns and notes a disparity between perceptions of women’s productivity and actual measurements, highlighting persistent problematic assumptions.


This article points out that traditional metrics often unfairly favor one group, and argue for the use of “altmetrics” that more truly reflect all of the work of the discipline.

**CAREER ADVANCEMENT TO ADMINISTRATIVE ROLES**


This interview-based, multi-site assessment of programs to support women advancing into leadership roles identifies some of the reasons preventing advancement, interventions that can help, and areas requiring more significant and widespread support.


These three papers detail issues of institutional culture that systematically hinder women from advancing into administrative leadership positions.

**MENTORING**
Based on review of a literature, and data from the 2002 Survey on Doctoral Education and Career Preparation, with a sample size of 4010, the authors found that race and gender influence how grad students perceive their relationship with women of color facing greatest disadvantage in perceived adviser support.


This research study on effective mentoring of early-career women faculty in STEM argues that both peer mentoring circles with facilitated meetings, and informal mentoring benefit women's career advancement and can serve to change organizational culture.


This study supports the value of peer mentoring as a successful alternative to the dyadic mentoring model for women faculty in academic medicine.

SALARY EQUITY STUDIES


Using salary data for 10, 241 physicians at 24 public medical schools and controlling for age, experience, faculty rank, specialty, scientific authorship, NIH funding, clinical trial participation and Medicare reimbursements, the authors found that female physicians earn significantly less than males.


In response to the Chalikia study (2013), this study, based on multiple, real data sets, draws attention to the broader implications of using multiple regression models correctly or incorrectly, and the difficulties that ensue when these models are not built on an appropriate, sound statistical framework. The model must address the interaction of any indicator variable with each of the other predictor variables.


Important as context for the argument made by Billard (2016). Based on one case study, it addresses legal remediation and consequences for organizations that do not adhere to policies regarding pay equity.
THE PIPELINE

Kristen Renwick Monroe, William F. Chiu. 2010. Gender Equality in the Academy: The Pipeline Problem. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 43: 2, 303-308. [https://doi.org/10.1017/S104909651000017X](https://doi.org/10.1017/S104909651000017X)

The article critiques the perceived “pipeline problem” in academia. It focuses in particular on the belief that gender inequality will decline once there are sufficient numbers of qualified women in the pool. However, the pipeline conceived in a simple sense is not the problem. Gender discrimination exists and affects women in multiple ways from mentorship in grad school, to attaining a first job at what kind of institution, and negotiating starting salary.

GOVERNANCE

James T. Minor. Faculty Diversity and the Traditions of Academic Governance, *New Directions For Institutional Research*, no. 159 © 2014 Wiley Periodicals, Inc. Published online in Wiley Online Library (wileyonlinelibrary.com) • DOI: 10.1002/ir.20053

*This chapter describes the interaction between shared governance and the recruitment and retention of a diverse faculty, by considering the impacts of decentralization and academic freedom on decision-making.*

SEXUAL HARASSMENT AND MISCONDUCT


*This article reports on a survey of graduate students to report on the prevalence and impacts of sexual and gender-based harassment. Results include descriptions of negative outcomes, which may be helpful in understanding the breadth of harm to victims.*


*This comprehensive report details results of a survey of undergraduates to assess the incidence, prevalence and characteristics of sexual assaults, misconduct and harassment at participating institutions. The report also includes information about demographics, awareness of procedures and patterns of reporting.*


*This survey-based study explores the reasons that faculty members had left institutions and identifies the important roles that gender-based harassment and discrimination may play in these departures. Other issues, such as family-related concerns and recruitment and retention offers are also discussed.*

An ad hoc committee has been formed under the oversight of the Committee on Women in Science, Engineering and Medicine to undertake a study of the impacts of sexual harassment on women in the science, technical and medical workforce. The committee has completed numerous open meetings, with videos available online, and will be issuing a report during the summer of 2018.