Recruiting a Diverse Faculty
In Academic Medicine

Vivian Lewis
Acting Deputy to the President
Acting Vice Provost for Faculty Development and Diversity
Associate Dean for Women and Diversity
Making the case for greater faculty diversity

We need faculty who more closely mirror society to:

• Improve access to healthcare given that minority faculty seek practice sites that serve minority populations more often than majority faculty

• Facilitate education of our students to learn culturally competent care from faculty who can authentically provide this training

• Help inform the research agenda towards the needs of minority and underserved communities
A More Diverse Nation

Estimated Population by Race/Ethnicity, 2002

- White (196,826,971), 68.3%
- Black (35,200,585), 12.2%
- Native American & Native Alaskan (2,155,239), 0.7%
- Asian (11,276,812), 3.9%
- Native Hawaiian Pacific Islanders (383,512), 0.1%
- Multiple Races (3,641,701), 1.3%
- Hispanic (37,960,418), 13.2%
- Multiple Hispanic (539,561), 0.2%
- Hispanic (37,960,418), 13.2%

Data Source: Population Division, U.S. Census Bureau; Table 3: Annual Estimates of the Population by Sex, Race and Hispanic or Latino Origin for the United States: April 1, 2000 to July 1, 20005 (NCEST2005-03). Release Date: May 10, 2006
Area’s diversity on the upswing

A HARBINGER OF POLITICAL CLOUT IN CENSUS DATA

MEAGHAN M. MCDERMOTT
AND NICOLE LEE

Although Monroe County isn’t one of the more than 300 counties in the United States where minority populations have become the majority, the local minority population continues to grow.

According to estimates released today by the U.S. Census Bureau, there’s been an upswing in all minority groups locally, with some of the largest growth in the area’s population of Asian people, black people, people of Hispanic ethnicity and people of two or more races.

Erika Rosenberg, an analyst with the Center for Governmental Research, said the numbers “highlight the need for children and adults to become better prepared to live and work in diverse settings.”

According to the Census Bureau, more than 300 of the nation’s 3,141 counties are now more than 50 percent minority. Minority

CENSUS, PAGE 5A

What’s at stake

Who we are. Experts say the area’s changing demographics may bring new political clout to some minority groups and highlight the need to become accustomed to racial and cultural diversity.

EJ Figueroa, 14, of Rochester joins the record crowds — an indicator of growth in the area’s Hispanic population — at this year’s Puerto Rican Festival. Asian and black populations also rose significantly.

22 Percentage of minority population of the six-county Rochester region.

175,944 Number of Monroe County residents who belong to a minority group.

14 Number of people of Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander heritage living in Orleans County.

4 Percentage increase in population of all races and ethnic origins in Ontario County between 2000 and 2006. In the six-county region, only Ontario County had an overall increase in population.
### URMC compared to peers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Total faculty</th>
<th>% Women</th>
<th>Total URM</th>
<th>%URM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Columbia</td>
<td>1752</td>
<td>39.7%</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johns Hopkins</td>
<td>2463</td>
<td>36.9</td>
<td>281</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago</td>
<td>881</td>
<td>32.9</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvard</td>
<td>7484</td>
<td>38.3</td>
<td>621</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duke</td>
<td>1055</td>
<td>29.7</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yale</td>
<td>1061</td>
<td>32.4</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case-Western</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornell Weill</td>
<td>2292</td>
<td>34.6</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanford</td>
<td>787</td>
<td>25.5</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penn</td>
<td>1790</td>
<td>31.3</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington U</td>
<td>1606</td>
<td>30.1</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rochester</td>
<td><strong>1424</strong></td>
<td><strong>32.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>63</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.4</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*AAMC Faculty Roster March 2009*
Why haven’t we done better?

- Institutional finances impact the ability to hire
- Reputation on diversity issues
- Hiring practices vary by department and position
- Lack of attention or resources to facilitate finding diverse candidates
The Pool Problem (myths vs. reality)

- There simply aren’t any minority candidates in (fill in the blank) field.
- Minority candidates are so highly sought-after, we can’t afford to even try to hire one.
- Scholars of color wouldn’t be interested in living in Rochester.
- Minority candidates don’t come from the strongest doctoral programs.
- URM candidates have earned ~12% of doctoral degrees annually in recent years.
- A national study of URM recipients of prestigious fellowships indicates that only 11% were actively recruited for faculty positions.
- Rochester has very vibrant communities, attractive to all kinds of people.
- Some of the highest producers of URM doctorates are top tier institutions.
Top Producers of Minority Physicians

**African American**
- Howard University
- Meharry
- University of Illinois
- Wayne State
- Temple University
- University of North Carolina
- University of Michigan
- Harvard University
- SUNY-Downstate
- UMDNJ-New Jersey Medical

**Hispanic**
- University of Puerto Rico
- Caribe
- Ponce
- University of Illinois
- Texas-San Antonio
- UCLA
- Miami
- Texas-Galveston
- UCSF

**Native American**
- University of Oklahoma
- University of Minnesota
- University of North Dakota
- Washington University
- University of Hawaii
- UCSF

Data source-AAMC 1950-2004
Diversity in the Physician Workforce: 2006
Leadership Recruiting Practices in Academic Medicine
How Medical Schools and Teaching Hospitals Search for New Department Chairs and Center Directors

Summary of Findings

1. Medical schools are constantly searching for new leaders.
2. The average leadership search in medical schools takes a full year.
3. The use of search committees is the norm; the use of search firms is not.
4. Deans appear satisfied with many aspects of the leadership search process, but less so with outcomes in achieving a more diverse leadership team.
5. Identifying candidates with the right background, skills, and abilities is the most vexing challenge in the leadership search process.
6. To address the challenges of recruiting new leaders, deans have undertaken innovative search strategies such as centralizing the search process, preparing prior to launch, and setting search committee expectations.

AAMC- September 2009
Deans registered their most intense dissatisfaction with the number of finalists for each position who were women or racial/ethnic minorities.

Dean’s satisfaction with aspects of the search process for department chairs and center directors

### F. The number of women finalists

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Clinical chair</th>
<th>Basic science chair</th>
<th>Center director</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very satisfied</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfied</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very dissatisfied</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### G. The number of finalists who were racial/ethnic minorities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Clinical chair</th>
<th>Basic science chair</th>
<th>Center director</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very satisfied</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfied</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very dissatisfied</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AAMC- September 2009
Questions to Consider Early in Search

- Thoughtful discussion of qualifications for position- ‘holistic’ definition
- How and where to advertise
- Need for identification of talent through outreach, e.g. specifically ask colleagues for names of women and minorities
- Role of unconscious bias
## Real-life Examinations of Career-related Unconscious Bias

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Trix &amp; Psenka (2003)</strong></td>
<td>The researchers analyzed 312 real letters of recommendation that helped medical school faculty receive their clinical and research positions. The letters were received by a large U.S. medical school from 1992 to 1995. Compared with letters of recommendation for males, letters for females were shorter, were more likely to be &quot;letters of minimal assurance&quot; (e.g., lacking in specificity), were more likely to contain gender terms (e.g., &quot;she is an intelligent young lady&quot;), and were more likely to include &quot;doubt raisers&quot; (e.g., criticisms, hedges, faint praise).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Wenneras &amp; Wold (1997)</strong></td>
<td>The researchers evaluated whether the peer review system of postdoctoral fellowships at the Swedish Medical Research Council was biased against women. For peer-reviewers to equally rate men and women on scientific competency, women needed an equivalent of approximately three more articles in <em>Nature or Science</em>, or 20 more articles in a specialist journal, such as <em>Neuroscience or Radiology</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goldin &amp; Rouse (2000)</strong></td>
<td>To test for sex-biased hiring in symphony orchestras, the researchers compared two audition procedures: &quot;blind&quot; auditions (adopted in 1970—involves the use of screens to conceal candidates' identities) and &quot;not-blind&quot; auditions (no use of screens). • Blind auditions increases the likelihood that a female will be hired by 25 percent. • The switch to blind auditions in 1970 explains 30 percent of the increase in the proportion of females among new hires.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bertrand &amp; Mullalnathan (2003)</strong></td>
<td>To examine the effect of race on receiving job callbacks, the researchers responded with fictitious resumes to help-wanted ads in Boston and Chicago newspapers. The resumes were altered from actual ones found on job search Web sites. The researchers categorized the new resumes as high or low quality and assigned them an equal number of traditionally black names (e.g., Lakisha) or traditionally white names (e.g., Greg). • Resumes with white names had a 50 percent greater chance of receiving a callback than did resumes with black names (10.08% vs. 6.70%, respectively). • Higher-quality resumes elicited 30 percent more callbacks for whites, whereas they only elicited 9 percent more callbacks for blacks. • Employers who listed &quot;Equal Opportunity Employer&quot; in their ad discriminated just as much as other employers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*For a complete bibliographical information in the literature in this table, see [http://www.aamc.org/data/aib](http://www.aamc.org/data/aib) AAMC- August 2009*
Best Practices During a Search

- Acknowledgement of unconscious bias
  - Framing the importance of diversity in the search
  - CV review
  - Roles of members of the search committee
- Consider standardized interview questions
- Allow adequate time for discussion of each applicant—cognitive shortcuts more likely with time pressure
University Level Resources*

- Compact for Faculty Diversity recruitment
- Recruitment Funds (requests through Deans’ Offices)
- Special Opportunities Fund
- HERC management (database of regional jobs in academia)
- Legal guidance memo
- Recruitment packets (local businesses, cultural organizations, neighborhoods, etc)
- Dual career assistance
- Search committee checklist
- Family friendly policies

[http://www.rochester.edu/diversity/faculty/index.html](http://www.rochester.edu/diversity/faculty/index.html)

*not a comprehensive list
URMC Specific Resources

- Search Committee Checklist
- Databases and Directories for Active Recruitment of Minorities and Women
- Writing a Job Ad
- Interviewing Tips
- Pipeline Development—encourage and mentor talented students and trainees. Minority supplements from NIH provide stipends for involvement of minority students from high school through medical school as well as junior faculty.
- Programs to foster the development of future minority faculty exist at several levels within URMC. This is not a comprehensive list.

URMC community

• Everyone wants to know that when they move they will find a community that they can feel comfortable in

• To achieve comfort tap into:
  • Community in the medical school
  • Community on campus
  • Community in the city

  *My office can help! 273-2010*

• Use these community members to keep the candidate engaged during the search process.
Recruiting a Diverse Faculty
In Academic Medicine

Vivian Lewis
Acting Deputy to the President
Acting Vice Provost for Faculty Development and Diversity
Associate Dean for Women and Diversity