The Fire This Time: Inequalities in the Time of COVID–19

Natalie Leblanc, Ph.D, MPH, RN
Assistant Professor
The Harriet Kitzman Dean’s Endowed Fellow in Health Disparities
University of Rochester School of Nursing
“Color is not a human or a personal reality; it is a political reality”

–James Baldwin. The Fire Next Time
Inequalities is the Foundation of Disparities - Timeline

AMERICAN SLAVERY
- 1619

JIM CROW
- 1865
- 1866: CONVICT LEASING
- 1933-9: THE NEW DEAL - REDLINING

CIVIL RIGHTS
- 1964
- 1985-1992: RENEWED "WAR ON DRUGS"
- 2003: IMMIGRATION, CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT (ICE) FORMED
- 1830: THE INDIAN REMOVAL ACT
- 1833-2020: MASS INCARCERATION
- 2020

DISPARITIES IN COVID 19 PANDEMIC
- 56 YRS.

1830: THE INDIAN REMOVAL ACT
- 1866: CONVICT LEASING
- 1933-9: THE NEW DEAL - REDLINING

1985-1992: RENEWED “WAR ON DRUGS”
- 2003: IMMIGRATION, CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT (ICE) FORMED
- 1833-2020: MASS INCARCERATION

1830: THE INDIAN REMOVAL ACT
- 1866: CONVICT LEASING
- 1933-9: THE NEW DEAL - REDLINING

1985-1992: RENEWED “WAR ON DRUGS”
- 2003: IMMIGRATION, CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT (ICE) FORMED
- 1833-2020: MASS INCARCERATION

SCHOOL OF NURSING
UNIVERSITY OF ROCHESTER
The Fire This Time: Inequalities in the Time of COVID-19

- Social Determinants of Health

- Public Health and Healthcare Approach
  - A Tale of Two Cities
  - Ethno-racial Disparities to COVID-19 Prevention
### Social Determinants of Health

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Stability</th>
<th>Neighborhood and Physical Environment</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Food</th>
<th>Community and Social Context</th>
<th>Health Care System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>Literacy</td>
<td>Hunger</td>
<td>Social integration</td>
<td>Health coverage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Access to healthy options</td>
<td>Support systems</td>
<td>Provider availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenses</td>
<td>Safety</td>
<td>Early childhood education</td>
<td></td>
<td>Community engagement</td>
<td>Provider availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt</td>
<td>Parks</td>
<td>Vocational training</td>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>Provider competency and cultural competency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical bills</td>
<td>Playgrounds</td>
<td>Higher education</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stress</td>
<td>Quality of care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>Walkability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zip code / geography</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Health Outcomes
- Mortality
- Morbidity
- Life Expectancy
- Health Care Expenditures
- Health Status
- Functional Limitations

---

Chin, T. et al. (2020) U.S. county-level characteristics to inform equitable COVID-19 response
Public Health and Healthcare Approaches
A Tale of Two Cities

Seattle, WA
688,245 pop.
7,137 cases, 513 deaths*

New York City, NY
8,560,072 pop.
185,206 cases, 14,881 deaths*

*As of May 13, 2020

Ethno-racial Disparities in COVID 19 Prevention

- Barriers to Testing
  - Accessibility & ethno-racial bias in testing provision
  - Gateway provider
  - Costs of testing and care
  - Behavioral factors

- Barriers to Prevention
  - Safe water access
  - Multigenerational “crowded” housing; high-density residential settings
  - Homelessness
  - Congregate facilities: prisons, nursing homes

Adapted from APHA COVID 19 Conversation webinar, by Dr. Georges C. Benjamin, Executive Director, April 2020
Ethno-racial Disparities and The Essential Worker

- Occupational Vulnerability
  - Occupational exposure
  - Community exposure
- Inadequate workplace protections
  - Physical environment
  - Benefits

https://www.ueunion.org/covid19
Delayed COVID Care Renders Disparity in Mortality?

Rana Zoe Mungin, 30 y.o.
April 27, 2020, NYC, NY

Skylar Herbert, 5 y.o.
April 19, 2020, Detroit, MI

David Fowler, 76 y.o. & Gary Fowler, 56 y.o.
April 6, 2020 Detroit, MI

Deborah Gatewood, 63 y.o.
April 19, 2020 Detroit, MI

Skylar Herbert, 5 y.o.
April 19, 2020 Detroit, MI
"We can’t unsee what we now know."

-Nina Turner, fmr Senator (Ohio)
The Fire Next Time: The Pandemic as a Portal

- Prioritize Equity
- Support Efforts Toward Innovation
- The Health and Death of People
Prioritize Equity in Targeted COVID 19 Testing
Exemplar Philadelphia, PA March 2020

A Framework for Rationing Ventilators and Critical Care Beds During the COVID-19 Pandemic

The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

SOUNDING BOARD

Fair Allocation of Scarce Medical Resources in the Time of Covid-19

Ezekiel J. Emanuel, M.D., Ph.D., Govind Persad, J.D., Ph.D., Ross Upshur, M.D., Beatriz Thome, M.D., M.P.H., Ph.D., Michael Parker, Ph.D., Aaron Glickman, B.A., Cathy Zhang, B.A., Connor Boyle, B.A., Maxwell Smith, Ph.D., and James P. Phillips, M.D.

Proposed allocation of scarce resources may exacerbate existing morbidity and mortality in Black, Hispanic, First Nation People and other marginalized communities.

https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/fullarticle/2763953
Prioritize Equity in Public Health

The CEO of Albertsons Companies and Kroeger Co. have teamed up with United Food and Commercial Workers International (UFCW) union to call on government officials to protect grocery workers by reclassifying them as extended first responders” or “emergency personnel.”

We cannot underestimate the power of labor unions and support and protections they bring to the essential worker.

Support Efforts toward Innovation
The Health and Death of People

• Black and Brown people are NOT inherently diseased – there is NO “mass of imperfections”
• Legacy of harm, violence, exclusion and inequality underlie persistent health disparities esp. in COVID morbidity and mortality
• The legacy of inequality manifests in the social determinants of health

The Pandemic as a Portal

- Humility, Empathy and Awareness
- Public Health and Healthcare Reform
- Inclusive Social and Fiscal Policies
- Reimagining of Self and Society

"Historically, pandemics have forced humans to break with the past and imagine their world anew. This one is no different"

ARUNDHATI ROY, NOVELIST
Selected Resources

• Seattle Race and Social Justice Initiative’s: Racial Equity Toolkit to Assess Policies, Initiatives, Programs, and Budget Issues:

• Government Alliance on Race and Equity’s:
  https://www.racialequityalliance.org/tools-resources/S
Extra Slides
Cases, Deaths, and Testing in All 50 States
FIGURE 4
People of color are more likely to report racial discrimination when trying to rent or buy housing

Likelihood of experiencing racial discrimination when trying to rent or buy housing by race/ethnicity, 2017

| Race/Ethnicity   | Likelihood
|------------------|-------------
| White            | 5%          
| African American | 45%         
| Asian            | 25%         
| Latino           | 31%         
| Native American  | 17%         

FIGURE 2

People of color have experienced lower homeownership rates for decades

Homeownership rate by race/ethnicity, 1940–2017

Black and white incarceration rates

Black: 915
White: 255

Black people are 3.6 times more likely than white people to be incarcerated.
Blacks make up a greater share of the population in the South, where most states have not expanded Medicaid.

**SHARE OF TOTAL POPULATION THAT IS BLACK BY STATE, 2017**

Uninsured Blacks are significantly more likely to fall into the coverage gap than Whites, earning too much for Medicaid but not enough for tax credits.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eligible for Financial Assistance</th>
<th>Eligible for Tax Credits</th>
<th>In the Coverage Gap in States that Did Not Expand Medicaid</th>
<th>Medicaid/Other Public Eligible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>29%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Blacks and Whites are non-Hispanic and exclude individuals of mixed race. Includes nonelderly individuals 0-64 years of age. Totals may not sum to 100% due to rounding. All values have a statistically significant difference from the White population at the p<0.05 level.

Source: Kaiser Family Foundation analysis of 2017 American Community Survey (ACS), 1 Year Estimates.
Hispanics face greater barriers to accessing care and receive less care than Whites.

Note: ^ Indicates in the past 12 months. Persons of Hispanic origin may be of any race; Whites are non-Hispanic and exclude individuals of mixed race. Includes nonelderly individuals 18-64 years of age. Data for uninsured includes nonelderly adults 19-64 years of age. All values have a statistically significant difference from the White population at the p<0.05 level.

Source: Kaiser Family Foundation analysis of 2017 American Community Survey (ACS), 2017 National Health Interview Survey.
Uninsured rate for Hispanics declined under the ACA, but they are still more likely to be uninsured than Whites.

**Uninsured Rate Among Nonelderly Adults 2013-2017**

- 2013: 40%
- 2014: 33%
- 2015: 28%
- 2016: 26%
- 2017: 25%

**Uninsured Rate Among Children 2013-2017**

- 2013: 6%
- 2014: 5%
- 2015: 4%
- 2016: 4%
- 2017: 4%

Note: Nonelderly adults are 19-64 years of age. Children are ages 0-18 years. Whites are non-Hispanic and exclude individuals of mixed race. All values have a statistically significant difference from the White population at the p<0.05 level.

Source: Kaiser Family Foundation analysis of 2017 American Community Survey (ACS), 1-Year Estimates.
Hispanic Adults in Families with Noncitizens Disproportionately Feel the Economic Fallout from COVID 19. Urban Institute & RWJ, 2020
Age-adjusted Prevalence of Obesity among US Adults, 2017–2018

https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/products/databriefs/db360.htm
As of April 2020

Black % of Population → Black % of COVID-19 Deaths

- Chicago*
  - Milwaukee County, Wis.*
  - Louisiana
  - Michigan
  - Mississippi
  - Illinois*
  - Alabama
  - South Carolina
  - Maryland
  - Philadelphia
  - District of Columbia*
  - North Carolina
  - New York City*
  - Connecticut*
  - Florida
  - California*
  - Minnesota

*Indicates data includes Latinos/Hispanics; + indicates percentage change over time.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Employment</th>
<th>Share of Black Workers</th>
<th>Share of Total Workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Office and Administrative Support</td>
<td>13.8%</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation and Material Moving</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>11.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Preparation and Serving-Related</td>
<td>6.5%</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care Support</td>
<td>5.4%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Care and Service</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Structural Vulnerabilities: CHD, HTN and the Uninsured

Chin, T. et al. (2020) U.S. county-level characteristics to inform equitable COVID-19 response
Systemic Racism in the Food System: Food Swamps, Food Desert, Food Insecurity