University of Rochester Rubric for Evaluating Dissertation and Oral Defense

Attribute	No Revisions Needed	Minor Revisions Needed	Major Revisions Needed
A UR PhD graduate should be			
able to:			
Mark the appropriate column with an "x" to indicate whether revisions are required for each dimension			
Select and defend significant	Criteria: Makes a	Criteria: Chooses	Criteria: Unable to express
	strong and compelling	significant topic but not	significance of topic
problem or topic for study.	case for significance of	fully placed in context	
problem of topic for study.	topic to the field.		
Demonstrate mastery of relevant	Criteria: Shows	Criteria: Demonstrates	Criteria: Shows limited
knowledge in the field.	innovative and valuable	adequate knowledge of	awareness of relevant work in
	critique of relevant	relevant work in the field	the field
	work in the field		
Apply rigorous methods of the	Criteria: Quality of	Criteria: Approach	Criteria: Flaws in approach
discipline.	scholarship is	demonstrates adequate	and questions about rigor
	innovative, thorough,	rigor	
	rigorous		
Produce a valuable contribution	Criteria: Outcome	Criteria: Outcome of	Criteria: Questions raised
to the field	moves field forward	work is useful to the field	about significance to the field
to the held	significantly and		
	insightfully		
Communicate effectively in	Criteria: Writing is very	Criteria: Writing is	Criteria: Written work requires
academic writing.	high quality, fluent,	correct and easily	major revision.
academic writing.	clear and effective	understood	
Effectively defend the work when	Criteria: Responses are	Criteria: Able to answer	Criteria: Limited ability to
questioned.	well-argued, insightful,	most questions	respond to questions or
questioneu.	and engaging	effectively and explains	explain decisions
	5 5 5	reasoning	,
Comments:	,		